

Chat from “One Year On: ‘The Gaelic Crisis in the Vernacular Community’”, The Edge UHI Seminar, July 2nd 2021

from JOANNA RODGERS 16021684 to everyone: 11:08 AM

Fàilte a h-uile duine. Welcome everyone and thanks for joining us. Please post any questions or comments in the chat - please send to "everyone" (rather than "all attendees" or directly to the host). After the panelist discussion there will be an opportunity to join the discussion by turning your camera and microphone on. Please send me a message in the chat if you would like the opportunity to turn on your camera and microphone to take part in the discussion at the end of the event. Many thanks!

from JOANNA RODGERS 16021684 to everyone: 11:10 AM

The Scottish Affairs articles can be found here <https://www.euppublishing.com/toc/scot/30/2>

from Gordon Wells to everyone: 11:12 AM

Gaelic Crisis book details here: <https://tinyurl.com/2wbmzx8d>

And the research digest here: <https://tinyurl.com/9rbdtrk7>

from Kirsty Macdonald to everyone: 11:14 AM

Tapadh leibh

from Iain Mackenzie to everyone: 11:17 AM

Madainn Mhath a Dun Eideann, tha seo feumail...

from Kirsty Macdonald to everyone: 11:25 AM

I agree Pàdruig and for me the issue of the context of the language is a big one

from Gordon Wells to everyone: 11:25 AM

Other LSI/Soillse projects revolving around recording natural speech, not necessarily “activist” – Saoghal Thormoid, Stòras Beò nan Gàidheal, Mediating Multilingualism – here:

<https://tinyurl.com/3wysbme6>

from Catriona Choinnich Isaac to everyone: 11:27 AM

Tapadh leat a Phadraig. Bu choir dha oifigearan bho na buidhnean oifigeal sin gu leir - croitearachd, aiseagan, smsaa a bharrachd air Gaidhlig - bhith steidhte anns na bailtean 's na h-eileanan

from Theona Morrison to everyone: 11:36 AM

Well said Rhoda

from Anne Frater to everyone: 11:37 AM

Tapadh leat, a Rhoda. Chan dean sinn cail ma bhios luchd bruidhinn na Gaidhlig an uganann a cheile.

from Ryan Dziadowiec to everyone: 11:37 AM

Echoing Kirsty above, regarding what Pàdruig and Rhoda have said, the importance of the vernacular communities is the entire context of Gaelic, it's as much about the Gàidhealach activities (cutting the peats together) as about the Gaelic spoken while this happens.

from Kirsty Macdonald to everyone: 11:37 AM

Fantastic Rhoda ❤️

from Udaya Narayana Singh to everyone: 11:39 AM

Identifying leaders among younger generation Gaelic or any other similar language fighting for survival is the biggest challenge, as it came out from the last two presentations

from Iain Mackenzie to everyone: 11:41 AM

Math dha rìreamh Rhoda. Cha dean sinn adhartas le 'na gaidheal an amhaichean a cheile.'

from Ragnhild Ljosland to everyone: 11:43 AM

This is really interesting, Iain MacKinnion. Do you think that the shift in ethnic versus civic view of Gaells/Gaelic speakers is in any way linked with the Scottish government's emphasis on civic nationalism in Scotland as a whole?

from Anne Frater to everyone: 11:45 AM

A very nuanced contribution, Iain. Would you say that people have been interpreting the findings of the research on a personal level, rather than a community one?

from JOANNA RODGERS 16021684 to everyone: 11:50 AM

Folks if you would like the opportunity to turn on your camera and microphone in order to participate in the discussion at the end, please send me a message in the chat and I will change your settings.

from Gordon Wells to everyone: 11:53 AM

Here's the link to the group "Guth nan Siarach" in which Jane is active: <https://www.guth-nan-siarach.org/>

from Catriona Choinnich Isaac to everyone: 11:56 AM

Tapadh leat Jane. That 'mental exhaustion' point you made is so right and true, and maybe a difficult thing for others to grasp

from Máire Ní Choncheanainn to everyone: 11:59 AM

míle buíoch libh ar fad. máire

from Ewan Kennedy to everyone: 11:59 AM

Hi Joanna, I'm here to listen, but would like to make a brief comment as a learner.

from Alannah Beaton to everyone: 11:59 AM

Deagh phuing, Jane. As part of Iomairt an Eilein - at points it does feel as though folk want to let you have your rant and that you'll then go quietly on your way...

from Travis Richardson to everyone: 11:59 AM

Madainn mhath! If possible, I would appreciate the opportunity to ask a question of the panelists during the discussion at the end of the event.

from JOANNA RODGERS 16021684 to everyone: 12:00 PM

I will change the settings of attendees who would like to join the discussion now. Please wait for Padruig to invite you to speak before turning on your microphone. Many thanks.

from Elin Haf Gruffydd Jones to everyone: 12:03 PM

Very interesting and thoughtful insights. I felt it was a real privilege to hear these contributions today. But at the same time, I also felt that I was eavesdropping and really wanted you to have this conversation in Gaelic not in English for our benefit. If possible to talk, I'd like to.

from Ragnhild Ljosland to everyone: 12:03 PM

Thank you very much, Iain, and thanks for using the Gaelic version of my name

from Elin Haf Gruffydd Jones to everyone: 12:03 PM

Although I wasn't around in Wales in 1962, listening to this morning's discussion, it made me think of that as a key moment of change in language politics here.

from Virginia Blankenhorn to everyone: 12:04 PM

A number of panelist mentioned the need for safe spaces for Gaelic speakers. There is a great deal to overcome, old assumptions to be challenged, but it is wonderful to see vernacular speakers challenging those assumptions, and reasserting the priority of Gaelic use in community settings, including meetings. What Pàdraig called the "unconscious" use of Gaelic – using it as a medium of communication rather than as a symbolic identity statement - is absolutely essential to progress within the vernacular community, if I may be so bold to say so. Here in the hinterlands (i.e. the Central Belt) we have problems of our own regarding the "safe" use of Gaelic, i.e. where it can be used for discussion of any topic, rather than simply for discussion of language matters.

from Shona NicIlinnein to everyone: 12:05 PM

Unfortunately I wasn't able to join the event until a few mins ago and would welcome the opportunity to provide some information and a comment or two.

from Theona Morrison to everyone: 12:06 PM

We know that young people who go through GME, it will not necessarily continue when it comes to choosing between subjects at the upper end of secondary education, so young people need to see it as being of value in life beyond school, beyond media. Traditionally fishing, construction, crofting all carried the language, There is work with Medical admissions around so that other professional jobs use the language of value both to the student and the patient.', likewise would be strengthened in Health and social care. the peat cutting was a good example. Otherwise young people see no more value in it than learning Mandarin.

from Anne Frater to everyone: 12:07 PM

Yes. We have to present the language as the key to a door, rather than as an end in itself.

from JOANNA RODGERS 16021684 to everyone: 12:07 PM

A recording of this event will be available here in the next few days
<https://www.uhi.ac.uk/en/research-enterprise/res-themes/interdisciplinary-research-programmes/the-edge-call-for-contributions/recorded-seminars/>

from Donald MacIntyre to everyone: 12:08 PM

Tapadh leat

from Michelle Macleod to everyone: 12:10 PM

Great point Ewan :) - many years ago when I worked in Islay I was wonderfully supported by young retirees who were so enthusiastic and committed to promoting the language locally - a great army.

from Iain Mackenzie to everyone: 12:18 PM

Agree with Michelle, there is a great hidden army, albeit some have given up on Gaelic in the communities. How do we motivate and mobilise them? For some their Gaelic community is currently Radio nan Gaidheal and BBC Alba.

from Lauren Pyott to everyone: 12:18 PM

Thanks for everyone's contributions, and for opening up this space and debate for all. If there's time, I wonder whether any of the panel members could speak to Travis Richardson's excellent comment about the need for recognising and engaging with the various intersectional indices within the Gaelic speaking community? (ie. LGBTQ+ / class etc)?

from Drew McNaughton to everyone: 12:18 PM

I have a question for the panellists, all of whom I have the utmost respect for their work and perseverance: if there is a message that you would like to give to the UN COP (and the UK Gov) what would that be? If it is something you would like to consider you can also contact me later.

from Drew McNaughton to everyone: 12:20 PM

My email if you want it (or anyone else) is contact@drewmcnaughton.net

from Elin Haf Gruffydd Jones to everyone: 12:22 PM

Activism is for life, but we all need a few 'wins' to help us through!

from Christopher Lewin to everyone: 12:24 PM

from Christopher Lewin to all attendees: 2:21 PM

All positive points from Shona, but to make significant progress we need to lobby the Scottish Government directly for resources, powers and infrastructure considerably beyond what the Bord and other Gaelic agencies currently possess. The single most important contribution Bord na Gaidhlig could make would be to open up a space where Gaelic speakers and supporters feel able and empowered to engage in open debate and lobby for that change which builds on but goes far beyond current policy, whatever exact shape that might take.

from Kirsty Macdonald to everyone: 12:24 PM

I have a comment if I can unmute in a bit

from Virginia Blankenhorn to everyone: 12:24 PM

Excellent comment by Elin regarding the "dilution of the continuum" by inserting the "new speaker" category into it. We don't need more divisions of this kind. Aligned to this question, I would love to know if anybody has bothered to distinguish between the "identity" that you absorb at home, which is mostly unconscious until challenged, and the "identity" that you choose in later life as an extension or even as a replacement for the one you started with. The issue of identity has taken up quite a bit of oxygen in academic studies, largely concerning the identities of those learning the language.

from Daibhidh Eyre to everyone: 12:24 PM

Yes please, Conchúr.

from Alannah Beaton to everyone: 12:24 PM

Tha mi smaoinichadh gu bheil tòrr dhaoine òga làn spionnadh ag iomairteachd son a Ghàidhlig ach tha sinn reusanta ùr agus sinn a' dèanamh sin. A bheil comhairle sam bith aig dhaoine a tha air a bhith dèanamh seo son bliadhnaichean mòra dhuinne a tha air ùr thòiseachadh?

from Theona Morrison to everyone: 12:24 PM

Not sure if you were asking me, I couldn't unmute. If not me then that's fine!

from Drew McNaughton to everyone: 12:27 PM

Mòran taing! Rhoda if you want to get in contact, or indeed any of the panellists, please get in touch. contact@drewmcnaughton.net

from Travis Richardson to everyone: 12:29 PM

I just feel that if Gàidhlig is to be very productive, it would be interesting to know now the language is used (or not) among a variety of different groups to index that identity. That's the focus of my studies anyway.

from Daibhidh Eyre to everyone: 12:31 PM

Sin sibh a chàirdean. Many thanks to Joanna, the authors, and the panel. The energy is palpable, even in this seminar. I wanted to make three points.

1. Can we leverage the Scottish Languages Bill as a way of resourcing the kind of civic forum discussions and consultations Conchur highlighted?
2. I understand the point Padruig made about Gaelic activism, and that it then becomes a language of activists. But in terms of GME, I listened to a really interesting presentation by Tim Armstrong on how we can help GME pupils make a conscious decision to use Gaelic, and - if I understood it correctly - it was tied to the idea of activism, of helping pupils recognise what the aim of GME is - about creating a new generation of teachers. What does the panel think? I'm a NQT going into primary teaching in the central belt in August, so it's an important question for me.
3. I understand Iain's take, and I agree with it to a large extent. I understand why there is a move to 'sell' Gaelic as a language that belongs to everyone. I'd maybe like to see some more analysis and evidence that there was an academic project with an ideology behind it. I'm not as interested in 'Gael', as I am in the idea of democracy and agency, as Jane highlighted. There is no doubt in my mind that my having learned Gaelic to a reasonable level (I was born in the Coatbridge mentioned on the poster!) does not fill the gap left by the death of a native speaker. The needs of communities

where there are 40% - or even 20% - speakers, are very different from a community where there are 2%, but the need for democracy and agency in planning for language provision unites them both. Concentrating on that idea, I think, could be a more fruitful, unifying framing of the debate. I think we need to remember that learners had support for their national organisation pulled by BnG, with little explanation or justification. It'

from Daibhidh Eyre to everyone: 12:33 PM

It's not only native speakers in the vernacular communities who have been affected by a lack of democracy, agency and accountability.

Tapadh leibh.

from Rhoda Meek to everyone: 12:33 PM

@travis - thank you for your comments! Your question about intersectionality is great and so relevant. I think it is at the core of a lot of the debate right now but we're not always great at recognising it. Indexing is not my field though!

from JOANNA RODGERS 16021684 to everyone: 12:34 PM

Folks, I will save the chat in a PDF and include it as a link on the website next to the recording. <https://www.uhi.ac.uk/en/research-enterprise/res-themes/interdisciplinary-research-programmes/the-edge-call-for-contributions/recorded-seminars/>

from Iain Mackenzie to everyone: 12:35 PM

Tapa leibh uile, I can feel the positive energy...

from Daibhidh Eyre to everyone: 12:35 PM

I think there's an issue with my mic - apologies.

from Theona Morrison to everyone: 12:36 PM

what will be the way forward now?

from Ryan Dziadowiec to everyone: 12:36 PM

Tapadh leibh a h-uile duine, gu sònraichte na panelists ach gach duine a bhruidhinn rinn uile an-diugh cuideachd. Bha an deasbad cho beòthail agus smaoinichail. Chòrd sin rium gu mòr dhà-rìreabh. Agus an dòchas gum bi tòrr chothroman mar seo againn uile san àm ri teachd.

from Kirsty Macdonald to everyone: 12:36 PM

Tapadh leibh

from Michelle Macleod to everyone: 12:36 PM

Tachartas inntinneach agus cudromach.